

## SYSTEMATIC ANNUAL SEARCH AND REVIEW PROTOCOL

### Highlights

- The Systematic Annual Search and Review (SASR) aims to ensure that the Clearinghouse for Labor Evaluation and Research (CLEAR) includes the most up-to-date literature on topics of interest to CLEAR audiences, no matter how much evidence is available for a topic. To accomplish this, the SASR focuses on identifying labor-related research based on the time period it was released, rather than its topical focus.
- The SASR identifies causal studies of a range of labor-related interventions (including programs, policies, and strategies, such as employment and training programs, unemployment services, workplace health and safety programs, employment benefits, and workers' compensation), assesses the quality of causal evidence, and makes this evidence accessible to broad audiences on an annual basis. Causal studies are those that examine the effectiveness of an intervention.
- The SASR considers all causal studies on labor-related interventions to be eligible. CLEAR implements the SASR each year to find the latest research, or may run a search for a time frame of interest to the U.S. Department of Labor (DOL). Eligible studies are then screened for relevance to CLEAR audiences. This screening process includes studies examining interventions across a variety of topic areas. All studies must be published in English.
- The SASR assesses the strength of a causal study's design and methodology and rates a study as providing causal evidence that is high, moderate, or low quality.

### Objective

The purpose of the SASR is to ensure CLEAR includes the most up-to-date literature on labor-related topics, including topics with larger and smaller amounts of evidence. To accomplish this, the SASR focuses on identifying and reviewing causal studies on labor interventions of relevance to CLEAR audiences that are released in a particular time period. Criteria for relevance were informed by extensive discussion with DOL, Federal evidence review staff, independent contractors involved in supporting the CLEAR program, and a panel of independent subject matter experts. Beginning in 2021, the SASR will be conducted on an annual basis. However, SASRs may also be conducted based on a target year when the included studies were released or multiyear time period to identify relevant studies previously omitted from CLEAR. Research relevant for CLEAR audiences includes studies that examine interventions that are labor related. (Table B.1 in Appendix B lists relevant topics.) Table 1 lists the outcomes of interest for the SASR, along with their definitions.

To be eligible for review as part of the SASR, studies must examine an outcome of interest, use analytical strategies to assess the effectiveness of an intervention, and be released in the target year and published in English; in addition, the studied intervention must take place in the United States.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> The restriction to research from the United States means that the SASR does not include some of the research needed to update topic areas that include research from other countries. To update these topic areas, CLEAR conducts literature searches with keywords that are more targeted to the topic area but not restricted to the United States. The searches may also examine additional databases and websites, as appropriate.

**Table 1. Outcome domains and definitions**

Outcome domain	Definition
Attitudes	People's opinions or feelings, particularly about their work, job, workplace, or employer, though this varies from study to study
Child labor	Outcomes related to programs designed to reduce employment below the minimum age established in national legislation, though the definition may vary by study, time, and location
Compliance	Employer behavior, particularly with respect to employment, compensation, and workplace conditions, that follows state and federal regulations. (Note that outcomes related to compliance with health and safety regulations fall under the health and safety domain.)
Earnings and wages	Payment a person receives in return for work performed during a certain period of time. Payment might be calculated in terms of a salary, commission, hourly wage rate, or piece rate basis, and people might receive payments on various schedules (such as weekly or every other week).
Education and skills gains	Increases in educational accomplishments or skills as reflected by years of schooling; accumulation of educational credits; or receipt of diplomas, degrees, certificates, or certifications
Employer benefits receipt	The act of a person receiving nonwage compensation from employers such as paid leave, supplementary pay or bonuses, insurance benefits, or retirement benefits
Employment	Working or obtaining work for pay from an employer, or for profit or fees in one's own business
Health and safety	The degree to which workers are free from illness or injury and are in a state of physical, mental, and social well-being in the workplace. This is maintained by identifying and controlling the risks arising from workplace hazards.
Public benefits receipt	Receiving benefits from the government, such as unemployment insurance, workers' compensation, Temporary Assistance for Needy Families, Social Security, or Medicare
Training	Programs and education to build knowledge and skills that prepare people for general employment or specific jobs or occupations

Note: These domains and their definitions were developed in consultation with multiple DOL agencies and subagencies and subject matter experts. The domains are designed to include all potentially relevant outcomes. This protocol will be revised if other relevant outcome domains are identified.

The remainder of this document further describes the research eligible for review (including eligible outcomes, study designs, and topics) and outlines the causal evidence guidelines used in the reviews. Appendix A provides details about the systematic search procedures and the screening process by which CLEAR selects eligible studies for review. Appendix B lists the set of tags used to categorize the studies considered for review.

### Eligibility criteria

CLEAR conducts broad literature searches (see Appendix A for details) to identify all the research papers and reports released in the period targeted for the SASR that use causal designs to examine the effectiveness of labor-related studies (see Table B.1 in Appendix B for the full list of topics and subtopics that DOL considers as labor related). After conducting these searches, CLEAR determines whether studies are eligible for review, using the following criteria:

- **Outcome:** The study must examine an outcome in at least one relevant domain. Table 1 lists the domains of interest.

- **Study design:** The study must use analytical strategies to assess the effectiveness of an intervention. Under the [Causal Evidence Guidelines](#), CLEAR currently reviews studies with the following designs: randomized controlled trials (RCTs), interrupted time series (ITS) studies, and other quasi-experimental and nonexperimental studies (including studies using matched comparison groups, difference-in-differences, instrumental variables, and fixed effects; correlational or descriptive studies that make causal claims; and studies using regression-based models such as ordinary least squares, hazard, logit, probit, and tobit models).<sup>2</sup> (See pages 4 and 5 of this document for details on comparison groups, subgroups and settings, and pages 5 and 6 for details on subgroup findings.)
- **Topic:** The study must examine the effectiveness of a labor-related intervention that focuses on at least one topic relevant for DOL and CLEAR audiences (as determined based on extensive meetings with subject matter experts; see Appendix B).
- **Geographical area:** The studied intervention must take place in the United States and must use a sample of firms, workers, or other entities in the United States.
- **Time frame:** Only studies released in the target period for the search are eligible for review.
- **Language:** The study must be published in English to be considered for inclusion in CLEAR.
- **Population characteristics:** This protocol does not have restrictions based on population characteristics.

### Causal evidence guidelines specific to the SASR

CLEAR employs a standardized, systematic review process as documented in its CLEAR Policies and Procedures document.<sup>3</sup> The SASR includes experimental, quasi-experimental, and nonexperimental causal research that CLEAR reviews and rates based on the eligibility criteria previously described and the CLEAR Causal Evidence Guidelines.<sup>4</sup> In assessing the quality of the evidence, CLEAR uses ratings of high, moderate, or low. Only two types of studies may receive a high rating: well-conducted RCTs with low attrition and no obvious confounds to the RCT design, and ITS designs with sufficient replication. Studies using matched comparison groups, difference-in-differences, instrumental variables, and fixed effects and studies using regression-based models such as ordinary least squares, hazard, logit, probit, and tobit models may receive a moderate rating. Correlational or descriptive studies that make causal claims and studies that use pre/post tests such as analysis of variance or t-tests may only receive a low rating. Only eligible studies receive an evidence rating.

The CLEAR Causal Evidence Guidelines describe in detail the criteria for rating the quality of evidence, although there is room for customization within protocols. The guidelines include additional guidance specific to the SASR for the following factors:

---

<sup>2</sup> CLEAR is in the process of developing evidence guidelines for regression discontinuity designs. Studies with regression discontinuity designs are currently reviewed under the guidelines for descriptive study reviews and are not yet considered eligible for the SASR.

<sup>3</sup> CLEAR Policies and Procedures are available at <https://clear.dol.gov/about>.

<sup>4</sup> The CLEAR Causal Evidence Review Guidelines are available at <https://clear.dol.gov/about>.

**Attrition standard.** In assessing an RCT, the SASR uses a conservative attrition standard (see the Causal Evidence Guidelines), because most CLEAR topic areas use this standard for attrition.<sup>5</sup> If CLEAR determines that an RCT has high attrition, the study cannot receive a high causal evidence rating, and CLEAR uses regression analysis criteria to review the study.

**Control variables for quasi-experimental and nonexperimental designs and RCTs with high attrition.** To receive a moderate evidence rating, quasi-experimental and nonexperimental causal research (along with RCTs with high attrition) must include specific control variables in its regression analysis or use fixed effects (see Causal Evidence Guidelines, Criterion Regression.1). Regression methods that incorporate a matching design must match on these control variables; if not, they must include them as controls in the regression.

For the SASR, studies examining outcomes for **individuals or groups of individuals** must include statistical controls for the following:

- Age
- Race/ethnicity
- Gender
- A pre-intervention measure of each outcome of interest

Studies examining outcomes for **organizations** (such as firms or plants) or **groups of organizations** must include statistical controls for the following:

- A measure of size (for example, number of employees, number of sites, annual revenue, annual production)
- State, if multiple states are included in the analysis
- Sector (for example, manufacturing, mining, construction), if multiple sectors are included in the analysis
- A pre-intervention measure of each outcome of interest

Table 2 specifies the pre-intervention measure requirements by outcome domain. Unless otherwise noted, these baseline measures must be collected before (and may be collected immediately before) the intervention begins.

Also under this protocol, studies can include analyses conducted at the group level (an aggregation of entities, such as institutions, employers, or communities). For group analyses, it is typically necessary to include group-level controls for the same variables as in the individual analyses. In this case, though, the findings should be interpreted with caution because for group-level studies, effects might reflect changes in group composition as well as an intervention's effects on outcomes. However, group-level studies can still receive a high or moderate rating (see Causal Evidence Guidelines, Special criterion for estimates of group-level effects for details).

---

<sup>5</sup> Note that the What Works Clearinghouse currently refers to this attrition threshold as the "cautious" attrition threshold.

**Table 2. Required controls for pre-intervention measure of outcome, by outcome domain**

Outcome domain	Pre-intervention measure requirements
Attitudes	At least one measure of attitudes <i>and</i> at least one measure of either earnings or employment status
Child labor	At least one measure of child labor <i>and</i> at least one measure of household socioeconomic status, such as household income, poverty, asset ownership, parental education, or social class
Compliance	<b>For studies of individuals:</b> At least one measure of earnings or employment status (such as earnings or wages, employment status, or measures of work history) <b>For studies of organizations:</b> At least one pre-intervention measure of organizational compliance
Earnings	Previous earnings at least one year before program participation (meaning at least 366 days before the start of the program)
Education and skill gains	Education level or academic achievement <i>and</i> socioeconomic status. Academic achievement measures could include prior grade point average, standardized test scores, placement test scores, and so on. Socioeconomic status could include receipt of need-based financial aid (Pell Grant or subsidized loans), student's tax status (dependent or independent), student's household composition (number of adults and number of children), student's household income, public benefit receipt, and parents' highest education.
Employer benefits receipt	At least one measure of earnings or employment status (such as pre-intervention earnings or wages, pre-intervention employment status, or measures of pre-intervention work history)
Employment	Employment status <i>or</i> earnings at least one year before program participation (meaning at least 366 days before the start of the program)
Health and safety	At least one measure of health status or experience with safety incidents
Public benefit receipt	Public benefit receipt <i>or</i> individual or household socioeconomic status
Training	Measure of training (such as pre-intervention receipt, duration, or intensity of a job-related training)

Note: Required pre-intervention measures are taken from CLEAR topic area protocols, which have been subject to review by subject matter experts.

**Changes in group composition.** In order for studies with nonexperimental designs and analysis at the group level to receive a moderate causal evidence rating, the composition of the intervention and comparison groups should not change in ways related to the outcome of interest (Causal Evidence Guidelines, Criterion Regression.4). Under this protocol, CLEAR uses the conservative attrition standard to assess whether changes in group composition are small or large (see Causal Evidence Guidelines, Special criterion for estimates of group-level effects for details). Group-level designs are subject to additional criteria, but effects should still be interpreted with caution due to the potential for changes in group composition to drive estimated impacts.

**Pre-intervention data for ITS designs.** An ITS design must use data drawn from a sufficiently long period of time before an intervention's implementation (Causal Evidence Guidelines, Criterion ITS.2). Under this protocol, data must cover at least one year before the implementation of the intervention.

**Subgroup findings.** Findings for the full study sample are used to assign a study a causal evidence rating. CLEAR does not combine findings across subgroups but does report findings on subgroups of study participants. These findings do not contribute to the causal evidence rating.

For previous review efforts, CLEAR has documented effects for several specific subgroups of individuals or firms. The subgroups of interest for previous review efforts are listed in Table 3. Following these past efforts, the SASR will document findings on these subgroups.

**Table 3. Subgroups for which findings have been previously documented by CLEAR**

<b>Category</b>	<b>Subgroups</b>
Age	Adults, older workers, youth
Employment barriers	Disability, justice-involved, other barriers
Employment status	Disconnected youth, dislocated or displaced worker, employed, self-employed, unemployed
Gender	Female, male, other
Occupational characteristics	Education professional, STEM professional
Race/ethnicity	American Indian or Alaska Native, Asian, Black or African American, Hispanic of any race, multiracial, Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander, White, combinations or specific racial or ethnic groups (for example, Black or Hispanic of any race)
Skill level	High-skilled, low-skilled, groups based on educational attainment
Special populations	Homeless, immigrant, low-income, parent, veteran or military
Industry	Specific industries or groups of industries
Firm size	Large business, small business
Urbanicity	Urban, rural

Note: These subgroups were developed in consultation with multiple DOL agencies and subagencies and subject matter experts and are designed to include the groups most relevant to decision makers. This protocol will be revised if other subgroups of interest are identified.

## APPENDIX A: LITERATURE SEARCH PROCESS

This appendix describes the search criteria and considerations for the SASR. CLEAR restricts its review of labor-related studies to research released (that is, published or made public) during a specific time period.<sup>6</sup>

### Database search

For the SASR, CLEAR searches the following electronic databases: Academic Search Premier, Business Source Corporate Plus, EconLit, Education Research Complete, SocIndex with full text, E-Journals, ERIC, APA PsycINFO, ProQuest Dissertations and Theses, and Scopus.

CLEAR uses a modified Peer Review of Electronic Search Strategies (PRESS) method (McGowan et al. 2016) to create and refine the search terms. Under this method, one librarian carefully searches the selected electronic databases, documenting each step of the process. Another librarian then applies most of the PRESS 2015 Evidence-Based Checklist to provide guidance and check the results (McGowan et al. 2016, Table 1).<sup>7</sup>

CLEAR searches for eligible literature using five sets of keywords: outcome terms, impact terms, design terms, study terms, and geographic terms (Table A.1). Each set is linked with all of the other sets using the Boolean operator AND (or NOT for the terms in the geographic set). Within each set, each keyword is linked with all of the other keywords using the Boolean operator OR. Specifically, CLEAR searches for studies that had at least one of all of the following: outcome term, impact term, design term, study term, and geographic term.<sup>8</sup>

---

<sup>6</sup> Many publications have a draft version that has not been accepted or an online version that is released before print, in addition to a print version. For the SASR, CLEAR considers a study to be eligible for review if any version of the publication was released in the target year. If multiple versions were released, such as both an online and print version, the print version is reviewed (so long as any version of the publication was released in the target year). In addition, if multiple citations present the same findings, CLEAR reviews a study so long as at least one of the related citations was released in the target year.

<sup>7</sup> McGowan, Jessie, Margaret Sampson, Douglas M. Salzwedel, Elise Cogo, Vicki Foerster, and Carol Lefebvre. "PRESS Peer Review of Electronic Search Strategies: 2015 Guideline Statement." *Journal of Clinical Epidemiology*, vol. 75, 2016, pp. 40–46.

<sup>8</sup> For the SASR, CLEAR validated the search strategy using a modified version of the PRESS method.

**Table A.1. Keywords used in comprehensive search**

Eligibility criteria	Keywords
Outcome terms (searched in subject and keyword fields)	earn* OR job OR employer OR employment OR employee OR unemploy* OR labor OR labour OR wage* OR worker* OR workplace OR "industrial safety" OR occupation* OR "affirmative action" OR "out-of-work" OR "return to work"
Impact terms (searched in title, abstract, subject, and keyword fields)	impact* OR effect* OR efficac* OR benefit* OR improv* OR progress OR grow* OR increas* OR decreas* OR reduc* OR gain* OR decline OR higher OR lower OR success*
Design terms (searched in title, abstract, subject, and keyword fields)	assign* OR baseline OR causal OR counterfactual* OR "comparison group" OR "control group" OR "difference*-in-difference*" OR "difference* in difference*" OR experiment* OR "fixed effect*" OR "instrumental variable*" OR match* OR "non experimental" OR "non-experimental" OR nonexperimental OR "quasi experimental" OR "quasi-experimental" OR quasiexperimental OR random* OR RCT OR QED OR regression OR "two stage least squares" OR "two-stage least squares" OR "interrupted time series"
Study terms (searched in title, abstract, subject, and keyword)	study OR studies OR research OR evaluat* OR analysis OR examin* OR intervention* OR trial OR pilot OR assess* OR program* OR treatment OR practice OR strateg* OR approach* OR technique OR curricul* OR demonstration OR model* OR policy OR policies OR initiative
Geographic terms (searched in full text)	"America*" OR "United States" OR "U.S." OR "US" OR Alabam* OR Alaska* OR Arizona* OR Arkansa* OR Californi* OR Colorad* OR Connectic* OR Delaware* OR Florid* OR Georgia* OR Hawaii* OR Idaho* OR Illinois* OR Indiana* OR Hoosier OR Iowa* OR Kansa* OR Kentuck* OR Louisian* OR Maine* OR Maryland* OR Massachus* OR "Bay State*" OR Michigan* OR Minnesota* OR Mississippi* OR Missouri* OR Montana* OR Nebraska* OR Nevada* OR "New Hampshir*" OR "New Jersey*" OR "New Mexic*" OR "New York*" OR Carolin* OR Dakota* OR Ohio* OR Oklahoma* OR Oregon* OR Pennsylvania* OR "Puerto Ric*" OR "Rhode Island*" OR Tennesse* OR Texas OR Texan OR Utah* OR Vermont* OR Virginia* OR Washington* OR Wisconsin* OR Wyoming* OR "District of Columbia" OR "Washington D.C." OR Samoa* OR Guam* OR Mariana* OR "Virgin Island*"
Exclude (searched in full text)	"Latin America*" OR "South America*" OR "Pan America*"



## Gray literature search

As part of the SASR, CLEAR performs targeted searches of the websites of the following organizations to identify additional studies:

- [Abdul Latif Jameel Poverty Action Lab](#)
- [Abt Associates](#)
- [American Enterprise Institute](#)
- [American Institutes for Research](#)
- [Association for Public Policy Analysis and Management](#)
- [Booz Allen Hamilton](#)
- [Brookings Institution](#)
- [Cato Institute](#)
- [Center for Economic and Policy Research](#)
- [Center for Law and Social Policy](#)
- [Center for Science and Engineering Partnerships](#)
- [Center for the Study of Urban Poverty](#)
- [Congressional Research Service](#)
- [Corporation for National and Community Service](#)
- [Heritage Foundation](#)
- [IMPAQ International](#)
- [Institute for Policy Studies](#)
- [Johns Hopkins Institute for Health and Social Policy](#)
- [Institute for Policy Research](#)
- [Institute for Research on Poverty](#)
- [IZA](#)
- [Joblessness and Urban Poverty Research Program](#)
- [Joint Center for Political and Economic Studies](#)
- [Massachusetts Budget and Policy Center](#)
- [Mathematica](#)
- [MDRC](#)
- [Multidisciplinary Program in Inequality and Social Policy](#)
- [National Bureau of Economic Research](#)
- [National Center for Children in Poverty](#)
- [National Center for Health Research](#)
- [NORC](#)
- [Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development](#)
- [Pacific Research Institute](#)
- [Public Policy Associates](#)
- [Poverty Solutions](#)
- [RAND Corporation](#)
- [Ray Marshall Center](#)
- [Resources for the Future](#)
- [RTI International](#)
- [Social Policy Research Associates](#)
- [SRI International](#)
- [Stanford Center on Poverty and Inequality](#)
- [The Center on Poverty and Inequality at Georgetown University](#)
- [University of Kentucky Center for Poverty Research](#)
- [Urban Institute](#)
- [U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics](#)
- [U.S. Department of Labor](#)
- [U.S. Department of Labor, Chief Evaluation Office](#)

- [U.S. Department of Labor, Employment & Training Administration, Publication Database](#)
- [U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Administration for Children & Families](#)
- [U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Administration for Children & Families, Office of Planning, Research, & Evaluation](#)
- [U.S. Government Accountability Office](#)

These sources of research are relevant to the review, but they have restrictions on use of date ranges or on certain fields. Therefore, CLEAR uses the following search string to identify relevant gray literature:

(earnings OR wage OR job OR employer OR employment OR employee OR unemployment OR labor OR worker OR workplace OR workforce)

AND

(impact OR effect OR effective OR effectiveness)

AND

(baseline OR causal OR comparison OR control OR experiment OR experimental OR random OR randomized OR regression OR treatment OR nonexperimental)

AND

(research OR evaluation OR analysis OR intervention OR study OR pilot).

CLEAR also performs keyword searches of research clearinghouses and working paper databases housed on the following publicly available websites: Arnold Ventures, The Campbell Collaboration, Pathways to Work Evidence Clearinghouse, RePEc, Self-Sufficiency Research Clearinghouse, Social Science Research Network, and What Works Clearinghouse.

#### **Additional avenues for inclusion**

In some cases, the search might overlook a citation from the target year. If such a citation is identified in the course of other CLEAR activities (for example, a researcher may report that a citation is missing), CLEAR investigates and includes the citation if it meets the eligibility criteria outlined in this protocol.

## APPENDIX B: TOPIC TAG GLOSSARY

This appendix includes the list of topics that have been identified as relevant for CLEAR audiences (Table B.1). This list, which is also available on the CLEAR website,<sup>9</sup> will be revised if DOL identifies other relevant topics.

**Table B.1. Topic tag glossary**

Topic	Subtopic	Tag	Tag definition <sup>a</sup>
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Health and Safety	Workplace injury or work-based illness	Policies, programs, and standards related to injuries or illnesses that occur as a result of a workplace event, or exposure to a harmful substance, as a result of carrying out job duties regardless of work location. This includes injuries or illnesses experienced in mine-based locations.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Health and Safety	Health	Policies, programs, and standards that promote a workplace free from hazards likely to cause physical harm or death. Health standards relate to remedying working conditions which are unsanitary or hazardous, for example preventing exposure to a harmful agent.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Health and Safety	Safety	Policies, programs, and standards that promote a workplace free from hazards likely to cause physical harm or death. Safety standards relate to requirements that employers provide safe workplaces and protective equipment for workers.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Health and Safety	Substance abuse recovery	Policies, programs, and standards related to overcoming a substance use disorder, for example an addiction to alcohol or illicit drugs. Recovery can involve lifestyle changes and abstaining from substance use as well as participation in formal recovery programs and support services.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Health and Safety	Inspections	Policies, programs, and standards related to inspections to determine a company's compliance with laws and regulations related to worker health or safety. In the United States, inspections are intended to ensure employers are providing workplaces free of hazards that could lead to employee injury or illness.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Health and Safety	Mine safety and health	Policies, programs, and standards that prevent death, illness, and injury from mining and promote safe workplaces for miners.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Health and Safety	Other health and safety	Policies, programs, and standards that promote a workplace free from other health- or safety-related concerns and are not covered under other tags under the subtopic "Health and Safety." As an example, this may include high hazard notification letters that OSHA sends to establishments.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA)	Policies, programs, and standards that relate to the Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA). FLSA is the Federal law that establishes the general conditions of employment in the United States, including the minimum wage, overtime pay, recordkeeping, child labor standards, and equal pay provisions.

<sup>9</sup> See <https://clear.dol.gov/reference-documents/CLEAR-Topic-Tagging-Protocol>.

Topic	Subtopic	Tag	Tag definition <sup>a</sup>
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Minimum wage	Policies, programs, and standards related to the floor (minimum) wage set by Federal law through the Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA) and/or individual states and municipalities (which may be set higher than federal levels). The minimum wage differs for tipped workers and non-tipped workers.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Overtime	Policies, programs, and standards related to employees working in excess of the maximum allowable workweek, during which covered nonexempt employees are paid one-and-a-half times their regular rate of pay for each excess hour worked. For most nonexempt workers this rule applies to hours worked in excess of 40 hours per week.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Recordkeeping	Policies, programs, and standards related to the requirements around an employer's wage and benefit recordkeeping. The Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA) requires that employers keep records of employee wages and hours as well as personal information about their employees. These records are used to enforce FLSA regulations including minimum wage, overtime, child labor, and equal pay provisions.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Wage violation	Policies, programs, and standards related to violations of the Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA). FLSA establishes the general conditions of employment in the United States, including the minimum wage, and rules for overtime pay. Employers who are found to violate the requirement of FLSA are subject to civil and criminal penalties.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Family and Medical Leave Act (FMLA)	Policies, programs, and standards related to the Family and Medical Leave Act (FMLA). FMLA is a Federal law that allows for eligible employees to take unpaid leave of up to 12 weeks in a 12-month period for the birth or adoption of a child, convalescence for a serious health condition, or to care for a family member with a serious health condition. A longer period of leave is permitted to care for a family member with a serious injury or illness if the family member is in the military.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Employer provided retirement benefits	Policies, programs, and standards related to voluntary retirement plans offered by employers, including defined-benefit pension plans and tax-advantaged contribution plans like 401(k)s or 403(b)s.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Federal retirement benefits	Policies, programs, and standards related to retirement benefits of federal government employees. The Federal Employees Retirement System (FERS) defines the retirement benefit programs for federal employees, including the Basic Benefit Plan and Social Security which pay annuities to retired workers, and the Thrift Savings Plan which is a defined contribution plan.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Health insurance	Policies, programs, and standards related to employee or individual health insurance. Health insurance plans provide partial or total coverage of healthcare costs after payment of a premium.

Topic	Subtopic	Tag	Tag definition <sup>a</sup>
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Disability insurance	Policies, programs, and standards related to disability insurance programs, program eligibility, or benefits. There are several programs which provide accident and disability insurance for workers who become sick or injured. These include workers' compensation programs and Social Security Disability benefits programs administered by the federal government.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Flexible medical or child-care spending accounts	Policies, programs, and standards related to flexible spending accounts. Flexible spending accounts allow workers to put earnings from employment into tax-free accounts to spend on qualified healthcare and child-care expenses. Earnings placed into these accounts are pre-tax dollars that are free from income taxes.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Employee Retirement Income Security Act (ERISA)	Policies, programs, and standards related to the Employee Retirement Income Security Act (ERISA). ERISA is the Federal law which sets minimum standards for private sector, employer-provided retirement plans in order to protect employee participants in these plans. Protections include the fiduciary standard, a grievance process, vesting and benefit accruals, and plan funding.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Consolidated Omnibus Budget Reconciliation Act of 1985 (COBRA)	Policies, programs, and standards related to the Federal law which provides workers with the option to continue their employer-based health insurance coverage after they leave employment or are otherwise no longer eligible to receive coverage. Coverage can be continued under COBRA for a limited period by the employee paying the health insurance premium payment.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (HIPAA)	Policies, programs, and standards related to the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (HIPAA). HIPAA is a federal law which establishes rules for protecting the privacy of individual health records.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Paid leave	Policies, programs, and standards related to an employers' paid leave policy. Paid leave allows employees to take time of work and receive pay. Paid leave is not required by federal law, but several states require employers to provide paid leave.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Life insurance	Policies, programs, and standards related to life insurance. Life insurance is a contract between an insured policyholder and an insurer that pays a monetary benefit to the beneficiaries of the insured at the time of their death.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Domestic partner benefits	Policies, programs, and standards related to an employer's domestic partner benefits. Domestic partner benefits are employer-sponsored benefits—for example, health insurance or pension plan survivor benefits—that are extended to domestic partners of employees. Domestic partners are defined by the employer and can include unmarried same- or opposite-sex partners that maintain a common residence.

Topic	Subtopic	Tag	Tag definition <sup>a</sup>
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Tuition assistance	Policies, programs, and standards related to employer tuition assistance programs, which provide direct assistance to employees or their dependents to pay for college or college credit-granting courses while maintaining employment.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Supplemental Security Income (SSI)	Policies, programs, and standards related to the Supplemental Security Income (SSI) program or program benefits. SSI is a program of the Social Security Administration which pays a cash benefit to certain eligible individuals who are age 65 or older, blind, or disabled and have limited income.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Workers' compensation	Policies, programs, and standards related to workers' compensation. Workers' compensation benefits provide employees with wage replacement benefits in the event of a workplace injury or illness.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Wages and Benefits	Other wages and benefits	Policies, programs, and standards related to other incentives provided to employees by their employer that are not covered under other tags under the subtopic "Wages and Benefits." As examples, these may include wellness benefits, cash bonuses, childcare assistance, or flexible work schedules.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Worker Organization Protections	Union and labor management standards	Policies, programs, and standards related to union and labor management relations. Labor management standards are governed by several federal laws, including the National Labor Relations Act (NLRA), which sets federal policy with regard worker protections, and the Labor-Management Reporting and Disclosure Act (LMRDA), which promotes financial integrity and transparency in private-sector labor unions.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Worker Organization Protections	National Labor Relations Board (NLRB)	Policies, programs, and standards related to regulations promulgated by the National Labor Relations Board (NLRB). NLRB is an independent federal agency that monitors, investigates, and remedies unfair labor practices. In addition, NLRB supports employees in conducting elections to certify or decertify labor unions.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Worker Organization Protections	Other worker organization protections	Policies, programs, and standards related to other worker protections to organize other than those provided by the National Labor Relations Act or promulgated by the National Labor Relations Board. As examples, these may include worker organization policies at the state or local level.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Other Worker Protections	Migrant and Seasonal Agricultural Worker Protection Act (MSPA)	Policies, programs, and standards related to the Migrant and Seasonal Agricultural Worker Protection Act (MSPA), a Federal law that provides protection to migrant and seasonal agriculture workers through employment standards around wages, housing, transportation, disclosures and employer recordkeeping.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Other Worker Protections	Migrant and seasonal workers	Policies, programs, and standards intended to provide protections to Individuals who travel within their own country or travel abroad for employment, or for those that work in a job on a temporary basis for a portion of the year.

Topic	Subtopic	Tag	Tag definition <sup>a</sup>
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Other Worker Protections	Immigration and Nationality Act (INA)	Policies, programs, and standards related to the Immigration and Nationality Act (INA), a Federal law that outlines provisions related to immigration law, naturalization, and refugee assistance.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Other Worker Protections	Foreign and temporary workers	Policies, programs, and standards intended to provide protections to individuals who are citizens or residents of another country and are employed in a different country on a temporary basis.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Other Worker Protections	Child labor	Policies, programs, and standards intended to minimize the involvement of children in prohibited work, and more generally, in types of work deemed socially and morally undesirable as guided by national legislation.
Compensation and Workplace Conditions	Other Worker Protections	Other worker protections	Policies, programs, and standards related to other worker protections that are not covered under other tags under the subtopic "Other Worker Protections." As examples, these may include wellness benefits, cash bonuses, childcare assistance, or flexible work schedules.
Employment and Training Services	Employment and Reemployment	Wagner-Peyser Act	Policies, programs, and standards related to the Wagner-Peyser Act, a Federal law enacted in 1933 and amended in 1998 and 2014 under the Workforce Investment Act and Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act, respectively. Wagner-Peyser and subsequent amendments provide for publicly funded employment and training services for youth, adult, and dislocated workers through one-stop service centers called American Job Centers.
Employment and Training Services	Employment and Reemployment	Labor Exchange	Policies, programs, and standards related to employment services provided in American Job Centers for employers and jobseekers, such as job search and placement assistance, job referrals, and recruitment services for employers.
Employment and Training Services	Employment and Reemployment	Adult and Dislocated Worker programs	Policies, programs, and standards funded under the Workforce Investment Act or the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act that aim to provide training and employment services to adults age 18 or older as well as to dislocated workers. A dislocated worker is an individual who has been terminated or laid off, or who has received a notice of termination or layoff, from employment. These workers include displaced workers who lost or left jobs as a result of permanent closure of, or substantial layoff at, their place of work. Displaced workers can also include the self-employed and displaced homemakers, though this varies from study to study.
Employment and Training Services	Employment and Reemployment	Youth programs	Policies, programs, and standards that target employment opportunities for youth aged 14-24.
Employment and Training Services	Employment and Reemployment	Older workers' programs	Policies, programs, and standards that support or improve the employment prospects and financial security of older workers aged 40 and above.
Employment and Training Services	Employment and Reemployment	Reentry	Policies, programs, and standards that target employment or reemployment opportunities for individuals recently released from state and Federal prison or for justice-involved youth.

Topic	Subtopic	Tag	Tag definition <sup>a</sup>
Employment and Training Services	Employment and Reemployment	Job search assistance and supportive services	Policies, programs, and standards designed to prepare job seekers for work, other than education and training. This can include identifying employment barriers, skills, and interests; assistance designing a resume and cover letter; job development or job placement; job clubs or job readiness workshops; job shadowing; work experience; and developing an individual employment plan.
Employment and Training Services	Employment and Reemployment	Work Opportunity Tax Credit (WOTC)	Policies, programs, and standards related to the Work Opportunity Tax Credit (WOTC). WOTC is a Federal tax credit given to employers for hiring individuals from groups that have faced significant barriers to employment in the past.
Employment and Training Services	Employment and Reemployment	Workforce Investment Act (WIA)/Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA)	Policies, programs, and standards related to the federal Workforce Investment Act (WIA) or Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA). WIA and WIOA authorize coordination between workforce development programs in order to provide employment services to jobseekers and employers at one-stop centers called American Job Centers. Programs authorized through WIA or WIOA may receive this tag even if WIA or WIOA is not explicitly mentioned in the study.
Employment and Training Services	Employment and Reemployment	Unemployment Insurance	Policies, programs, and standards related to programs that provide cash benefits to individuals who are currently unemployed through no fault of their own.
Employment and Training Services	Employment and Reemployment	Veterans' reemployment	Policies, programs, and standards that provide education or training or policies designed to support or improve the employment prospects of veterans of the U.S. Military.
Employment and Training Services	Employment and Reemployment	Supported employment or other employment supports	Policies, programs, and standards that create or support work opportunities for individuals who are vulnerable or economically disadvantaged and may not otherwise be employed. Programs may provide short-term work and income opportunities, or improve employability by offering training, work supports, and transition services to support participants as they move into unsubsidized employment.
Employment and Training Services	Employment and Reemployment	Other employment and reemployment	Other federal, state, or local policies, programs, and standards to encourage employment or reemployment of individuals that are not covered under other tags under the subtopic "Employment and Reemployment."
Employment and Training Services	Training and Education	Registered apprenticeship	Policies, programs, and standards related to the system of providing individuals within a trade or profession with structured learning, on-the-job training and mentorship, and a credential, while employed with a competitive wage.
Employment and Training Services	Training and Education	Work based and other occupational training	Policies, programs, and standards related to a system of training individuals within a trade or profession with on-the-job training which may include classroom-based instruction. Most training is done while working for an employer, often in exchange for the employee's continued labor for an agreed period after they have achieved measurable competencies.



Topic	Subtopic	Tag	Tag definition <sup>a</sup>
Employment and Training Services	Training and Education	Company required training	Policies, programs, and standards related to training programs that are required by a company for its employees.
Employment and Training Services	Training and Education	Vocational rehabilitation	Policies, programs, and standards related to assisting workers with disabilities, injuries, or physical or mental impairment that is a barrier to employment to return to employment.
Employment and Training Services	Training and Education	Mentoring	Policies, programs, and standards that relate to matching individuals with specific skills and knowledge with individuals who need or want the same skills and knowledge to advance in work or skill level.
Employment and Training Services	Training and Education	Community college education and other classroom training	Policies, programs, and standards related to education or training that occurs in a classroom, such as a community college course.
Employment and Training Services	Training and Education	Basic skills	Policies, programs, and standards related to adult basic education training or basic skills training, often required for individuals who fail to meet specified admission and placement requirements or because of predicted risk in meeting the requirements of college-level courses or occupational training curricula. Courses focus primarily on remedial skills in reading, writing, mathematics, and study and test-taking strategies.
Employment and Training Services	Training and Education	Capacity building programs	Policies, programs, and standards related to training or education programs intended to build the capacity of workers or employers for future employment opportunities. For example, Youth Opportunity grants aimed to improve the capacity of communities to serve low-income youth by encouraging collaboration across different systems involved in youth development and enhancing youth workers' skills.
Employment and Training Services	Training and Education	Workforce Investment Act (WIA)/Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) training programs	Policies, programs, and standards related to the Federal Workforce Investment Act (WIA) or Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA). Training which may be covered by WIA/WIOA includes high school equivalency, adult basic education, vocational certification, college courses, apprenticeships, and other forms of professional development.
Employment and Training Services	Training and Education	Science, Technology, Engineering, and Math (STEM) programs	Policies, programs, and standards related to science, technology, engineering, or math (STEM) training or education.
Employment and Training Services	Training and Education	Other training and education	Policies, programs, and standards related to other Federal, state, local, or employer-funded programs that provide or foster training and education and are not covered under other tags under the subtopic "Training and Education."

Topic	Subtopic	Tag	Tag definition <sup>a</sup>
Employment and Training Services	Employer Services	Rapid response	Policies, programs, and standards related to services provided in a timely fashion to employers and employees to prevent layoffs and promote reemployment. For instance, services can include helping firms re-train incumbent workers; helping coordinate services at firms that have announced layoffs and plant closing, by helping workers find rapid reemployment; or helping to avoid or otherwise remediate layoffs or plant closings.
Employment and Training Services	Employer Services	Layoff aversion	Policies, programs, and standards related to minimizing or preventing unemployment from layoffs, such as providing support to employers to minimize layoffs and identifying training programs for workers.
Employment and Training Services	Employer Services	Worker Adjustment and Retraining Notification (WARN) Act	Policies, programs, and standards related to the Worker Adjustment and Retraining Notification (WARN) Act. WARN requires employers with 100 or more employees to provide employees with at least 60 calendar days written advance notice of a plant closing or mass layoff. This is intended to protect workers and communities so that they can prepare for the transition.
Employment and Training Services	Employer Services	Employer partnerships	Policies, programs, and standards related to creating partnerships with employers to address their workforce needs through various training or education strategies. Partnering agencies can include federal, state, or local governmental agencies, educational institutions, or nonprofit organizations.
Employment and Training Services	Employer Services	Employer engagement programs	Policies, programs, and standards to develop employer-driven partnerships that focus on training, education, and skills of the workforce and key industries and that promote the training, hiring and retention of workers.
Employment and Training Services	Employer Services	Other employer services	Other Federal, state, or local regulations that provide services for employers and are not covered under other tags under the subtopic "Employer Services." As examples, these may include other services provided by a federal, state, or local government to aid employers or industries.
Other	Performance Data and Reporting	Data quality	Policies, programs, and standards related to improving the quality, breadth, and accessibility of data collected by workforce agencies. Data can describe, for example, wage records, unemployment benefit claims, and training and employment services provided.
Other	Performance Data and Reporting	Reporting accuracy	Policies, programs, and standards related to the accuracy and reliability of data and reports submitted by states and grantees using Federal funds.
Other	Performance Data and Reporting	Management information systems (MIS)	Policies, programs, and standards related to management information systems and data.
Other	Performance Data and Reporting	Report cards	Policies, programs, and standards related to creating or maintaining report cards, which give grades or scores to firms based on their performance in particular areas.

Topic	Subtopic	Tag	Tag definition <sup>a</sup>
Other	Performance Data and Reporting	Other performance data and reporting	Policies, programs, and standards that relate to other performance data or reporting and are not covered under other tags under the subtopic “Performance Data and Reporting.” For example, this could include other initiatives to gather or make accessible data about workforce characteristics or the performance of an employment service.
Other	Customer Satisfaction		Policies, programs, and standards focused on improving the satisfaction of consumers of a company’s products or services.
Other	Behavioral Interventions		Policies, programs, and standards that make use of insights from psychology and behavioral economics—such as nudges that incentive a specific employee behavior, or framing that presents a specific decision in a positive or negative context—to alter employee behavior.
Other	Disparities or Discrimination in Employment and Earnings	Employee rights	Policies, programs, and standards related to protecting the rights of employees in the workplace. Several Federal laws outline specific employee rights, including Title I of the Americans with Disabilities Act and the Rehabilitation Act of 1973.
Other	Disparities or Discrimination in Employment and Earnings	Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA)	Policies, programs, and standards related to the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). ADA is a Federal law that prohibits discrimination based on ability and requires employers to give reasonable accommodations to jobseekers and employees with disabilities.
Other	Disparities or Discrimination in Employment and Earnings	Individuals facing barriers to employment	Policies, programs, and standards related to protecting individuals facing barriers to employment, for example, those with language barriers, ex-offenders, or those with a disability.
Other	Disparities or Discrimination in Employment and Earnings	Preventing discrimination	Policies, programs, and standards related to preventing discrimination in the workplace based on characteristics like sex, race, color, national origin, religion, disability, or veteran status.
Other	Disparities or Discrimination in Employment and Earnings	Affirmative action	Policies, programs, and standards related to Federal requirements that Federal contractors and subcontractors take steps to ensure equal employment opportunities in hiring and promotion for underrepresented groups, including minorities, women, people with disabilities, and veterans. This can also be applied to employers that voluntarily adopt policies along these lines.
Other	Disparities or Discrimination in Employment and Earnings	Equal Employment Opportunity Act of 1972	Policies, programs, and standards related to the Equal Employment Opportunity Act of 1972 which established the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC). The EEOC has the authority to sue employers that discriminate based on race, color, religion, sex, or national origin. Discrimination can include in hiring, promotions, wages, termination, or disciplinary actions. The Act applies to public and private employers with 15 or more employees as well as labor unions.

Topic	Subtopic	Tag	Tag definition <sup>a</sup>
Other	Disparities or Discrimination in Employment and Earnings	Federal contractor regulations	Policies, programs, and standards related to Federal rules that bar contractors and subcontractors from discriminating based on sex, race, color, national origin, religion, disability, or veteran status. The rules were laid out Executive Order 11246, Section 503 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, and the Vietnam Era Veterans' Readjustment Assistance Act of 1974.
Other	Disparities or Discrimination in Employment and Earnings	Executive Order 11246 (E.O. 11246)	Policies, programs, and standards related to Executive Order 11246 that requires federal contractors and certain subcontractors who have over \$10,000 of business with the federal government engage in non-discriminatory practices in hiring and employment with regard to race, color, religion, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity and national origin.)
Other	Disparities or Discrimination in Employment and Earnings	Civil Rights Act of 1964	Policies, programs, and standards related to the Civil Rights Act of 1964, which prohibits discrimination on the basis of race, color, religion, sex, or national origin when making hiring and employment decisions.
Other	Disparities or Discrimination in Employment and Earnings	Other disparities or discrimination in employment and earnings	Policies, programs, and standards related to other federal, state, or local policies that prevent disparities or discrimination in employment or earnings and are not covered under other tags under the subtopic "Disparities or Discrimination in Employment and Earnings."

<sup>a</sup> Definitions are adapted from government agency definitions and reflect typical usage in the labor research literature, as well as input from the U.S. Department of Labor Chief Evaluation Office, CLEAR contractors, and other subject-matter experts, as appropriate.